



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

ISSUE CREATION

The procurement of clean resource attributes was included as a key work activity in the Resource Adequacy Senior Task Force (RASTF) charter. In order to focus efforts at the RASTF, a separate issue charge was approved by the Markets and Reliability Committee on April 27, 2022, establishing the Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF).

Issue Charge: <https://www.pjm.com/-/media/committees-groups/task-forces/capstf/postings/capstf-issue-charge.ashx>

ISSUE SUMMARY

The Organization of PJM States, Inc. (OPSI) established the OPSI Competitive Policy Achievement Staff Working Group (CPAWG) to develop and advance reform proposals that enable the procurement of resources in line with states' policy goals. The CAPSTF was created to coordinate a comprehensive discussion between the OPSI CPAWG, PJM stakeholders and PJM staff around enhancements to enable states and other willing buyers to procure clean resource attributes, on a voluntary basis, through a regional and centralized market.

CONSENSUS-BASED ISSUE RESOLUTION PROCESS

The CAPSTF held 13 meetings from June 2022 – May 2023, as well as a final meeting following a hiatus on September 22, 2023.

Vote Results (<https://www.pjm.com/-/media/committees-groups/task-forces/capstf/2023/20230523/20230523-capstf-poll--voting-results.ashx>)

Final Matrix (<https://www.pjm.com/-/media/committees-groups/task-forces/capstf/2023/20230523/20230523-item-06--solutions-matrix---capstf.ashx>)

1. RECOMMENDED PROPOSAL

N/A

No solution package reached the simple majority threshold to be recommended to the MRC

2. ALTERNATE 1 PROPOSAL

3. ALTERNATE 2 PROPOSAL

4. STANDING COMMITTEE RESULTS

N/A



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

APPENDIX I: SUPPLEMENTAL DOCUMENTS

Committee Page [\(link\)](#)

Issue Tracking [\(link\)](#)

APPENDIX II: PJM PARTICIPATION

Facilitator: Scott Baker

Secretary: Chris Callaghan

Advocate: Walter Graf

Subject Matter Experts: Emmanuele Bobbio, Ken Schuyler, Tim Burdis

PJM Legal: Daniel Vinnick, Chen Lu

APPENDIX III: STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION

[

Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Anders	David	PJM Interconnection	None
Anderson	Bob	Tenaska Power Services Co.	Generation Owner
Baker	Scott	PJM Interconnection	None
Bernabeu	Emanuel	PJM Interconnection	None
Bobbio	Emmanuele	PJM Interconnection	None
Brodbeck	John	EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owner
Callaghan	Chris	PJM Interconnection	None
Croop	Danielle	PJM Interconnection	None
Foladare	Kenneth	Geenex Solar LLC	Other Supplier
Giacomoni	Anthony	PJM Interconnection	None
Graf	Walter	PJM Interconnection	None
Guerry	Katie	Convergent Energy and Power LP	Other Supplier
Haque	Asim	PJM Interconnection	None
Heinle	Frederick	Dynegy Marketing and Trade, LLC	Generation Owner
Helm	Gary	PJM Interconnection	None
Hoatson	Tom	West Deptford Energy, LLC	Generation Owner
Hohenshilt	Jennifer	Talen Energy Marketing, LLC	Generation Owner
Kilgallen	Kevin	Avangrid Renewables, LLC	Generation Owner
Kogut	George	New York Power Authority	Other Supplier
LeithYessian	Devin	RTOinsider	



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

McGlynn	Paul	PJM Interconnection	None
Scarp	David	Calpine Energy Services, L.P.	Generation Owner
Swalwell	Brad	Tangent Energy Solutions, Inc.	Other Supplier
Walcavich	Colin	Green River Holdings, LLC	Generation Owner
Wilson	James	Other	
Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Abdur-Rahman	Muhsin	Dynegy Marketing & Trade, LLC (DECAM)	Generation Owner
Ackerman	Andrea	CAPS	
Akeel	Roddy	Enel Trading North America, LLC	Other Supplier
Anderson	Juliet	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Baker	Laura	Stone Mattheis Xenopoulos & Brew, PC	
Barker	Jason	Vitol Inc.	Generation Owner
Bennett	Stephen	PJM Interconnection	None
Berner	Aaron	PJM Interconnection	None
Bernstein	Matthew	PJM Interconnection	None
Bhana	Rajesh	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Bloom	David	Baltimore Gas and Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Borgatti	Michael	PJM Committee Voting Generic Account	
Bowring	Joe	Monitoring Analytics	
Brahman	Azade	Orsted Onshore North America, LLC	Generation Owner
Bruce	Susan	McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC	
Burdis	Timothy	PJM Interconnection	None
Callen	Zachary	Illinois Commerce Commission	
Campbell	Bruce	Enerwise Global Technologies, LLC	Other Supplier
Canter	David	Appalachian Power Company (AEP Generation)	Transmission Owner
Carretta	Kenneth	Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP	
Carroll	Rebecca	PJM Interconnection	None
Carson	Donna	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Chang	Sean	Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.	Other Supplier
Chen	Yang	PJM Interconnection	None
Chmielewski	Brian	PJM Interconnection	None
Christopher	Mahila	Public Utilities Commission of Ohio	
Cocco	Michael	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative	Electric Distributor
Concina	Wendell	Commonwealth Edison Company	Transmission Owner
Corash	Richard	PSEG Energy Resources and Trade LLC	Other Supplier



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

Crystle	Gil	UGI Development Company	Generation Owner
Dantonio	Phil	PJM Interconnection	None
Davis	David	Apex Clean Energy Holdings, LLC	
Davis	James	Dominion Energy Generation Marketing, Inc.	Generation Owner
DeLosa	Joe	The Brattle Group, Inc.	None
Deshpande	Nalin	Pine Gate Mid-Atlantic, LLC	Other Supplier
Domian	Christin	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
Dorko	Keri	Monitoring Analytics	
Domer	Amber	Rockland Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Downs	Jere	PJM Connect	
Drom	Rick	Rick Drom	
Dugan	Chuck	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Dumitriu	Nicolae	PJM Interconnection	None
Edmonds	Brian	DC Public Service Commission	
Esquivel	Manuel	Enel Trading North America, LLC	Other Supplier
Everngam	Scott	Blue Horseshoe Energy LLC	
Fan	Zhenyu	PJM Interconnection	None
Fee	George	Appalachian Power Company (AEP Generation)	Transmission Owner
Filomena	Guy	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Fink	Regan	Pine Gate Mid-Atlantic, LLC	Other Supplier
Fink	Sari	American Wind Energy Association	
Fishback	Luke	Affirmed Energy LLC (WMP)	Other Supplier
Fitch	Neal	NRG Power Marketing LLC	Generation Owner
Foley	Sheila	PJM Interconnection	None
Ford	Adrien	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative	Electric Distributor
Foster Cronin	Denise	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Fuess	Christian	PBF Power Marketing, LLC	End-Use Customer
Fuller	Peter	Autumn Lane Energy Consulting LLC	
Garnett	Bryan	Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Gates	Jill	PJM Interconnection	None
Gates	Terry	Appalachian Power Company (AEP Generation)	Transmission Owner
Gilani	Rehan	ConEdison Energy, Inc.	Other Supplier
Glatz	Suzanne	PJM Interconnection	None
Glazer	Craig	PJM Interconnection	None
Gordon	Jonathan	Advanced Energy Economy	



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

Gorman	Bradley	American Transmission Systems, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Greene	Joseph	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Greene	Zachary	World Resources Institute	
Greening	Michele	PJM Interconnection	None
Guntle	Vince	American PowerNet Management, L.P.	End-Use Customer
Hanser	Erik	Michigan Public Service Commission	
Hartung	Shanna	PJM Interconnection	None
Hauske	David	PJM Interconnection	None
Hauske	Thomas	PJM Interconnection	None
Heisey	Bradley	Tenaska Pennsylvania Partners, LLC	Generation Owner
Herel	Suzanne	PJM Interconnection	None
Horger	Tim	PJM Interconnection	None
Horning	Lynn Marie	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Horstmann	John	Dayton Power & Light Company (The)	Transmission Owner
Hull	Gerit	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Huntoon	Stephen	Chesapeake Transmission LLC	Other Supplier
Hyzinski	Tom	GT Power Group, LLC	None
Janicki	Diane	Boston Energy Trading and Marketing LLC	Other Supplier
Jardot	Gina	NRG Curtailment Solutions, Inc.	Other Supplier
Johnson	Carl	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Johnston	David	Other	
Jones	Scott	Other	
Kauffman	Brian	Enel X North America, Inc.	Other Supplier
Kazerooni	Hamid	PJM Interconnection	None
Kelly	Stephen	Brookfield Renewable Trading and Marketing LP (BSMH)	Other Supplier
Kent	Janessa	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
King	Matthew	GDS	
Kirk	Steven	NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC	Other Supplier
Kotras	Craig	Baltimore Gas and Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Lee	Lori Murphy	PJM Interconnection	None
Liang-Nicol	Cecilia	Allegheny Power (MonPwr Gen)	
Lieberman	Steven	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Lifson	Matthew	Institute for Policy Integrity	
Mabry	David	McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC	
Madu	Vivian	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

Mariam	Yohannes	Office of the People's Counsel for the District of Columbia	
Mason	Gary	Monongahela Power Company d/b/a Allegheny Power	Transmission Owner
Matheson	Douglas	SYSO LLC	Other Supplier
Maucher	Andrea	Delaware Division of the Public Advocate	
McClelland	Maura	Public Utilities Commission of Ohio	
McCormick	Katharine	Illinois Commerce Commission	
McDaniel	John	Baltimore Gas and Electric Company	Transmission Owner
McDowell	Christian	Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	
McGill	Susan	PJM Interconnection	None
McNeil	Justin	Kentucky Public Service Commission	
McNicholas	Daniel	Nautilus Power, LLC	Generation Owner
Mefford	Mark	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Megali	Brian	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Midgley	Sharon	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Mooney	Jeffrey	Allegheny Power (MonPwr Gen)	
Muhl	Nancy	PJM Interconnection	None
Nix	Emma	Leeward Asset Management, LLC	Generation Owner
Norton	Chris	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Ondayko	Brock	AEP Energy Partners, Inc. (AEP Gen Resources)	Transmission Owner
Oxenham	Ian	New Jersey Board of Public Utilities	
Pakela	Greg	DTE Energy Trading, Inc.	Other Supplier
Parrot	Sarah	Public Utilities Commission of Ohio	
Passman	Rachel	Jersey Green Energy LLC	Other Supplier
Patel	Keyurbhai	PJM Interconnection	None
Perera	Asanga	PJM Interconnection	None
Pieniasek	Marie	EDF Trading North America, LLC (Linden Cogen)	Other Supplier
Pino	William	Baltimore Gas and Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Poulos	Greg	PJM Committee Voting Generic Account	
Price	Robert	Sunenergy1	
Price	Ruth	Delaware Division of the Public Advocate	
Pungaliya	Rajat	Pine Gate Mid-Atlantic, LLC	Other Supplier
Rainey	John	Northern Virginia Electric Cooperative (NOVEC)	Electric Distributor
Reagan	Ryann	New Jersey Board of Public Utilities	
Rinkoski	Marie	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Roberts	Casey	Other	



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

Rohrbach	John	Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Rutigliano	Tom	Natural Resources Defense Council	
Rutledge	Craig	Appalachian Power Company (APCO Dedicated)	Transmission Owner
Saini	Ishwar	Macquarie Energy LLC (BGE MD Base)	Other Supplier
Sasser	Jonathan	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Scheidecker	Paul	Monitoring Analytics LLC	
Scheirer	Alexandra	PJM Interconnection	None
Schmitt	David	New Jersey Board Of Public Utilities	
Schreim	Morris	MD PSC	
Schuyler	Ken	PJM Interconnection	None
Selick	Sam	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Shields	Jeffrey	PJM Interconnection	None
Siegner	Katie	RMI	
Silverman	Abraham	NJ Board of Public Utilities	
Sloan	Ben	Organization of PJM States, Inc.	
Sorrels	James	AEP Appalachian Transmission Company, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Sotkiewicz	Paul	E-Cubed Policy Associates	
Sparks	Bridget	sPower Development Company, LLC	
Spees	Kathleen	The Brattle Group, Inc.	None
Stadelmeyer	Rebecca	Jersey Green Energy LLC	Other Supplier
Steichen	Rena	Bath County Energy, LLC	Generation Owner
Stern	Alexander	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Stines	Zachary	New Leaf Energy, Inc.	
Stupar	Rob	Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owner
Sturgeon	John	Duke Energy Business Services LLC	Transmission Owner
Suh	Jung	Calpine Energy Solutions, LLC	Other Supplier
Sussler	Philip	Office of People's counsel	
Svenson	Heather	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Sweeney	Rory	Power Prose, Inc.	
Swigonski	Frank	Pine Gate Mid-Atlantic, LLC	Other Supplier
Szeto	Connie	Orsted Onshore North America, LLC	Generation Owner
Tacka	Natalie	PJM Interconnection	None
Tekle	Zelalem	Bath County Energy, LLC	Generation Owner
Theodore	Sharon	Other	
Toppo	Shilpa	174 Power Global	



Clean Attribute Procurement Senior Task Force (CAPSTF) Final Report

Tribulski	Jennifer	PJM Interconnection	None
Tubridy	Meg	Rockland Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Unger	Matthew	State Corporation Commission (Commonwealth of Virginia)	
Walters	Jodi	Bloom Energy	
Watson	Brian	Appalachian Power Company (AEP Generation)	Transmission Owner
Wayner	Claire	RMI	
Wehnes	Kathleen	Maryland Department of the Environment	
Whitehead	Jeffrey	GT Power Group	
Widom	Stuart	PJM Interconnection	None
Wilkinson	Eric	Orsted Onshore North America, LLC	Generation Owner
Wray	Gizelle	Savion	
Yasutake	Sarah	Jersey Green Energy LLC	Other Supplier
Yi	Jin An	jinan	
Zolnierek	James	Illinois Commerce Commission	