

#	Desion Components <sup>1</sup>	Status Quo	Solution Options <sup>2</sup>				E	F
			A	B	C	D		
<b>0. General structure</b>								
1	Rate structure	Multiple regional/RTO-wide rates based on transaction types and behavior	Single RTO-wide fixed rate with true-up	Single RTO-wide fixed rate with deferred balance	Takes status quo, but eliminate regional rates. Everything allocated RTO-wide.	Regional fixed rate with true-up	Regional fixed rate with deferred balance	
2a	What period of time the rate applies to	Daily	Monthly (based on prior month)	Monthly (based on rolling average)	Annually (based on prior year+an adder)	Weekly rates		
2b	How is rate calculated							
3	Unusual circumstances	No specific treatment	Handle through true-up	Deferred balance with true-up for excess	Status quo up to a certain dollar amount. Costs are allocated differently above given dollar amount.			
4	Transactions that rate applies to	Everything listed below (DC# 5-25)	Realtime load, exports, imports, wheels, incs, decs, UTCs, realtime generation, economic demand response, emergency demand response	Deviations only (includes all virtuals). Wheels when realtime deviates from day ahead				
<b>1. Units cleared in DA market</b>								
5	DAOR allocation: Resource/transaction	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs						
6	DAOR allocation: Region	Entire RTO						
13	BOR allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load, RT Exports --- Deviations						
14	BOR allocation: Region	East/West < 500 kV --- RTO >= 500 kV						
17	Cancellation charges allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations						
18	Cancellation charges allocation: Region	RTO						
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR						
20	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales						
21	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases						
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface						
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system						
25	Reliability vs deviation logic (RT: Real time)	Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for all operating hours Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for any operating hours						
<b>2. Units not cleared in DA mkt and committed up to and including RT</b>								
13	BOR allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load, RT Exports --- Deviations						
14	BOR allocation: Region	East/West < 500 kV --- RTO >= 500 kV						
17	Cancellation charges allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations						
18	Cancellation charges allocation: Region	RTO						
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR						
20	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales						
21	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases						
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface						
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system						
24	Reliability vs deviation logic (RA: Reliability analysis)	Reliability: Maintain system reliability Deviation: Meet forecasted load plus reserves Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for all operating hours						
25	Reliability vs deviation logic (RT: Real time)	Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for any operating hours						
<b>3. Units are cleared in DA mkt not committed in real time (LOC credit)</b>								
15	LOC allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations						
16	LOC allocation: Region	RTO						
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR						
20	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales						
21	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases						
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface						
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system						
<b>4. Units reduced for reliability in real time (LOC Credit)</b>								
15	LOC allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations						
16	LOC allocation: Region	RTO						
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR						
20	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales						
21	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases						
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface						
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system						
<b>5. Reactive</b>								
7	Reactive allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load						
8	Reactive allocation: Region	Zone(s) < 500 kV --- RTO >= 500 kV						
<b>6. Black start</b>								
9	Black start allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load, RT Interchange Transactions Reservations						
10	Black start allocation: Region	Zone (Load) RTO (Interchange Transactions)						
<b>7. DASR</b>								
11	DAOR (DASR) allocation: Resource/transaction	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs						
12	DAOR (DASR) allocation: Region	Entire RTO						

8. Misc. energy uplift allocation							
26	Unallocated congestion (negative balancing congestion)	Same as DAQR: DA Load, DA Exports and DECs across the entire RTO					
27	Emergency DR	Net purchasers in the energy balancing market across the entire RTO (consider current filings)					
28	Economic DR	Same allocation provisions as generators					
29	Emergency Purchases	Net purchasers in the energy balancing market across the entire RTO					
30	Allocation of marginal loss surplus	Ratio shared to realtime load plus exports that pay for transmission services. Non-firm exports receive 31% of their allocations					
31	Allocation of FTR surplus/balancing congestion surplus	Within a planning year, surplus carries over from month-to-month. And is used to fund any FTR deficiencies from previous months within the planning year. If any excess surplus exists at the end of the planning year, can be used to fulfill ARR deficiencies. If no deficiencies exist, surplus will be allocated proportionally to FTR holders with positive target allocations.					

**Instru**

<sup>1</sup>Design Components - each is an "attribute" or "component" of any proposed solution. Consensus of the group should be sought on selection of a set of solution criteria.

<sup>2</sup>Solution Options - each is a solution alternative elicited from the stakeholder group that meet one of the specific solution criteria.

**To complete the matrix:**

1. Elicit from the stakeholder group a set of components (attributes) desired for any proposed solution. Enter a short label for each in the Design Components column.
2. If needed, enter a more detailed description of each criteria on the "Component Details" tab.
3. Using informal/non-binding voting, rate each component's priority in the final solution as "high/medium/low"
4. Elicit from the stakeholder group potential solution alternative(s) for each component. Enter a short label for each in the Solution Options columns.
5. If needed, enter a more detailed description of each potential solution option on the "Solution Details" tab.
6. Once the matrix is filled out, the group will attempt to select a single solution alternative (column) for each component (row) to form a solution "package".  
Example: cells 1B, 2C, 3A, 4B, 5D could make up a solution package.
7. If consensus is achieved on a single package (Tier 1 decision-making method), this will be documented in a Consensus Proposal Report to the parent committee.
8. If not, the group will identify up to 3 possible solution packages in a comparative Proposal Alternatives Report to the parent committee. (Tier 2 decision-making method).